

## The correct authorship of the name *Astur kienerii* (Rufous-bellied Hawk Eagle)

by Edward C. Dickinson

Received 12 February 2005

For almost 40 years credit for naming this species, now usually placed in the genus *Hieraaetus*, was accorded in publications on Indian birds to 'de Sparre, 1835' (Blyth 1852, Horsfield & Moore 1854, Hume 1869, 1873), but Sharpe (1874) credited the name to Geoffroy St Hil[aire] in 'Rev. Zool., 1845, pl. 35 (1835)'. Since then some writers have followed the earlier authors and others Sharpe.

In Horsfield & Moore (1854) the name is credited to de Sparre, but confusingly their first listed citation referred, using the name *Spizaetus Kienerii*, to 'Mag. de Zool. (1835) Ois. t. 35. Gervais'! This is the correct journal and plate, but reference to the original text page for Plate 35 only identifies the author as 'G.S.', and this is also what is found in the Table Méthodique for the year 1835, i.e. the index to the volume. The plate is also initialled similarly, although labelled *Falco Kienerii*. The generic name *Spizaetus* was not associated with the species here. So, there is nothing therein to firmly identify G. S. with either de Sparre, or Gervais, whose initials were F. L. P. However, the first page of the Table Méthodique (Fig. 1) is instructive. 'G.S.' appears twice and Gervais is listed as the author of four other species (depicted in Plates 41–44). Despite the different attributions, Gervais was cited as the author by Lesson (1843), Kaup (1848) and Schlegel (1862), as well as elsewhere.

In part, Sharpe's citation seems no more than a simple error, mistaking *Rev. Zool.* for *Mag. de Zool.* Presumably Sharpe did not see the Table Méthodique and deduced the authorship logically from the initials, although it is possible that Sharpe was not the first to do so. However, reference to the same page in the Table Méthodique, page iv, for the year 1835, shows that *Melogale fusca* (Plate 16 in Classe 1: Mammifères) is credited to 'Is[adore] Geoffroy' and *Hyena fusca* (Plate 17 in Classe 1: Mammifères) to 'Geoffroy St-H.'. These two usages may be a well-understood way to distinguish the young Isadore from his well-known father Etienne, but a third abbreviated form is used on page v, 'Geoff. St.H.', which is probably Etienne again. Whichever of this distinguished family of French naturalists could have been involved, it seems most unlikely that 'G.S.' would have been used for one of them, and one may reasonably conclude that Sharpe erred in his attribution.

Baker (1928) did not follow Sharpe's opinion, reverting to de Sparre, probably because Blanford & Oates (1895), whose *Fauna of British India* Baker was updating, had not followed Sharpe. Peters (1931) cited the right publication and gave the author as 'G.S. [= E. Geoffroy]' bringing in the father of Isadore. But Whistler & Kinnear (1936) used Sparre and Ali & Whistler (1943) de Sparre, as did

# TABLE MÉTHODIQUE

DES ESPÈCES ET DES GENRES DÉCRITS OU INDiquÉS<sup>1</sup>  
DANS L'ANNÉE 1835.

## 1<sup>re</sup> Classe. — MAMMIFÈRES.

		Notice.	Pl.
<i>MELOGALE fusca.</i>	Is. GEOFFROY.	XVI.	16
<i>HYENA fusca.</i>	Geoffroy St-H.	XVII.	17

## 2<sup>e</sup> Classe. — OISEAUX.

<i>ASTUR Kienerii.</i>	G. S.	XXXV.	35
<i>TIMALIA hypoleuca.</i>	Franklin.	XXXIX et XL.	39
— <i>hyperythra.</i>	Franklin.	<i>id.</i>	40
— <i>chataræa.</i>	Franklin.	<i>id.</i>	"
— <i>Horsfieldii.</i>	W. Jardine	<i>id.</i>	"
— <i>Malcolmi.</i>	Sykes.	<i>id.</i>	"
— <i>Somervillei.</i>	Sykes.	<i>id.</i>	"
<i>PLUCUS fringilloides.</i>	DE LAFRESNAYE.	XLVIII.	48
<i>FRINGILLA Cubæ.</i>	GERVAIS.	XLIV.	44
<i>PICA mystacalis.</i>	G. S.	XXXIV.	34
<i>PICOLAPTES zonatus.</i>	LESSON.	XLVI et XLVII.	"
— <i>scolopaceus.</i>	Spix.	<i>id.</i>	46
— <i>brunneicapillus.</i>	DE LAFRESNAYE.	<i>id.</i>	47
<i>ORNYTHYA Ricordii</i> ♂.	GERVAIS.	XLI et XLII.	41
— <i>id.</i> ♂.	<i>id.</i>	<i>id.</i>	42
— <i>cinnamomea.</i>	GERVAIS.	XLIII.	43
<i>BUCCEROS galeatus.</i>	Gmel.	XXXVIII.	38

<sup>1</sup> Les noms des espèces décrites sont en caractères romains ; ceux des espèces seulement indiquées sont en italique. Les genres nouveaux sont précédés d'un astérisque. Le chiffre romain indique le numéro placé en tête de chaque page de la notice ; le chiffre arabe, celui de la planche. — Le nom de l'auteur qui a nommé l'espèce est en petites capitales, seulement quand il est l'auteur de la notice.

Swann & Wetmore (1945). Since then, Smythies (1953), Ripley (1961, 1982) and Wells (1999) followed Peters (1931). Stresemann & Amadon (1979) did not follow Peters in plumping for Etienne Geoffroy St Hilaire and reverted to the non-specific 'G. S. = Geoffroy St Hilaire', and were followed by White & Bruce (1986). After a fruitless search for evidence (none of the authors cited above seems to have provided his rationale), Dickinson (2003) reverted to the identification used by Peters (1931) on the grounds that Isadore (1805–61) was more probable than Etienne (1772–1844).

Further evidence has finally been located. In 1839 an index (Table Méthodique) was compiled for the *Magasin de Zoologie* for the years 1831–38. This journal is most often bound by year (with the 1831–38 index no doubt usually bound in the 1838 volume), but was arranged in grouped pages by 'Classe' after the teaching of Cuvier. In one of the sets held in the Natural History Museum, South Kensington (Zoology Library; shelf mark ZS 940) the early parts are not bound by year, but with a volume for one 'Classe' or more, and in this set the index is not bound in the volume for Classe 2: Oiseaux, making it entirely understandable that the index has been overlooked. However, the index was located in one of the other contemporary volumes and therein *Astur Kienerii* is clearly linked to de Sparre.

Subsequently, I stumbled upon the footnote in Legge (1878), who made the same point as I have here concerning the usage of Geoffroy St Hilaire's name and also noted that 'in the Roy. Soc. Catalogue, vol. V' this is 'referred to as written by G. Sparre; and in all probability, this is the correct determination of the authorship'.

This rediscovered evidence, presumably originating from Guérin-Méneville, the publisher, and thus authoritative, completes the case for accepting Comte L. E. G. de Sparre (c.1800–54 or later: see Wynne 1966) as the author. G. S. had always seemed unlikely to translate to either Gervais or Geoffroy St Hilaire due to the evidence against this in the 1835 index.

#### Acknowledgements

Thanks go to Aasheesh Pittie for help with some of the references, to Laurel Peterson for assistance in obtaining the Lesson reference, and to the librarians at the Natural History Museum, South Kensington (NHM). I also acknowledge helpful comments by the referee, Murray Bruce.

#### References:

- Ali, S. & Whistler, H. 1943. The birds of Mysore. Part IV. *J. Bombay Nat. Hist. Soc.* 44: 9–26.
- Baker, E. C. S. 1928. *The fauna of British India. Birds*, vol. 5. Taylor & Francis, London.
- Blanford, W. T. & Oates, E. W. 1895. *The fauna of British India, including Ceylon & Burma. Birds*, vol. 3. Taylor & Francis, London.
- Blyth, E. 1852. *Catalogue of the birds in the museum [of the] Asiatic Society*. Baptist Mission Press, Calcutta.
- Dickinson, E. C. (ed.) 2003. *The Howard and Moore complete checklist of birds of the world*. Third edn. Christopher Helm, London.
- Horsfield, T. & Moore, F. 1854. *A catalogue of the birds in the museum of the Hon. East India Company*, vol. 1. W. H. Allen & Co., London.
- Hume, A. O. 1869. *My scrap book or rough notes on Indian oology and ornithology*. Calcutta.

- Hume, A. O. 1873. *Spizaetus Kienerii*, De Sparre. The Rufous-bellied Hawk Eagle. *Stray Feathers* 1: 310–313.
- Kaup, J. J. 1848. Zusätze zu den Falconidae. *Isis* 10: col. 772.
- Legge, V. 1878. *A history of the birds of Ceylon*. Part 1. London.
- Lesson, R. P. 1843. Index ornithologique (suite). *Écho Monde Savante* 10 (1): cols. 13–15.
- Peters, J. L. 1931. *Check-list of birds of the world*, vol. 1. Harvard Univ. Press, Cambridge, MA.
- Ripley, S. D. 1961. *A synopsis of the birds of India and Pakistan*. Bombay Nat. Hist. Soc., Bombay.
- Ripley, S. D. 1982. *A synopsis of the birds of India and Pakistan*. Second edn. Bombay Nat. Hist. Soc., Bombay.
- Schlegel, H. 1862. Monographie 4. Astures. Pp. 1–57 in *Mus. Hist. Nat. Pays-Bas, Rev. Méthod. Crit. Coll.*, livr. 2. E. J. Brill, Leiden.
- Sharpe, R. B. 1874. *Catalogue of the birds in the British Museum*, vol. 1. Trustees of the Brit. Mus., London.
- Smythies, B. E. 1953. *The birds of Burma*. Oliver & Boyd, Edinburgh.
- Stresemann, E. & Amadon, D. 1979. Order Falconiformes. Pp. 271–425 in Mayr, E. & Cottrell, G. W. (eds.) *Check-list of birds of the world*, vol. 1. Revised edn. Mus. Comp. Zool., Harvard Univ. Press, Cambridge, MA.
- Swann, H. K. & Wetmore, A. 1925. *A monograph of the Accipitriformes*. Part 2. Wheldon & Wesley, London.
- Wells, D. R. 1999. *The birds of the Thai-Malay Peninsula*, vol. 1. Academic Press, London.
- Whistler, H. & Kinnear, N. B. 1936. The Vernay scientific survey of the Eastern Ghats XIII. *J. Bombay Nat. Hist. Soc.* 38: 418–437.
- White, C. M. N. & Bruce, M. D. 1986. *The birds of Wallacea: an annotated check-list*. British Ornithologists' Union, London.
- Wynne, O. E. 1966. *Biographical key—names of birds of the world*. Privately published, Fordingbridge.

Address: Flat 3, Bolsover Court, 19 Bolsover Road, Eastbourne BN20 7JG, UK, e-mail: edward@asiaorn.org